



Pauli van Wyk <pauli@dailymaverick.co.za>

Scorpio query

Modise, Lavery <lavery.modise@hoganlovells.com>

Wed, May 2, 2018 at 4:55 PM

To: Pauli van Wyk <pauli@dailymaverick.co.za>, Mildred Thabane <Mildred.Thabane@hkstrategies.co.za>

Dear Pauli

I am not at liberty to discuss the merits of the PwC report or our final report to SARS. These are still privileged documents and are currently with the Chair of the Standing Committee on Finance until discussion on 23 May 2018. After this hearing, we hope we will be in a position to clarify any content of the report as it will be in the public domain.

If I am correct in assuming that you have the PwC report and ours, I can only request you to consider these reports carefully and in the full context of the public review which will now take place on 23 May which we hope to contribute to, and to treat their content fairly in your reporting.

Our recommendations to SARS were set out in our report to SARS, of which the PWC source of funds report was an annexure. It appears that your questions focus on only one aspect of the matter and we cannot answer them in isolation. We have repeatedly stated that we as attorneys and SARS as Mr Makwakwa's employer could not investigate criminal matters. These had to be investigated by the Hawks. This recommendation is clearly stated in our report. We encouraged this process to be undertaken.

I must disagree with your suggestion in your last paragraph. An employer cannot instruct or compel its employee to give information or documents outside the scope of the employer/employee relationship. Moreover, all employees have the right not to incriminate themselves, particularly where their conduct could lay the basis of criminal prosecution. Such is a basic tenet of our Constitution and a fundamental human right. That is where the relevant statutory bodies with the necessary authority or power to do so are requested to step in, and in this case the Hawks and the SAPS. As far as we know, the investigation is still ongoing and therefore Mr Makwakwa cannot be exonerated as you previously stated.

I trust that this assists you in your investigations.

Lavery Modise

Chairman

Hogan Lovells (South Africa) Inc.

140 West Street

Sandton

2196 Johannesburg

Tel: +27 11 286 6900

Direct: +27 11 523 6011

Fax: +27 11 286 6901

Email: lavery.modise@hoganlovells.com

www.hoganlovells.com

From: Pauli van Wyk [<mailto:pauli@dailymaverick.co.za>]

Sent: 02 May 2018 10:36 AM

To: Mildred Thabane; Modise, Lavery

Subject: Scorpio query

[Quoted text hidden]

This email is from Hogan Lovells (South Africa) Inc., an affiliated business of Hogan Lovells International LLP. Hogan Lovells International LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales.

"Hogan Lovells" is an international legal practice that includes Hogan Lovells International LLP, Hogan Lovells US LLP and their affiliated businesses. The word "partner" is used to describe a partner or member of Hogan Lovells International LLP, Hogan Lovells US LLP or any of their affiliated entities or any employee or consultant with equivalent standing. Certain individuals, who are designated as partners, but who are not members of Hogan Lovells International LLP, do not hold qualifications equivalent to members. The word "partner" may be used to refer to a director of Hogan Lovells (South Africa) Inc., but the use of that term does not indicate that Hogan Lovells (South Africa) Inc., is a partnership, nor that the directors of Hogan Lovells (South Africa) Inc. are in partnership with the partners or members of other entities in the Hogan Lovells international legal practice. For more information about Hogan Lovells, the partners and their qualifications, see www.hoganlovells.com.

CONFIDENTIALITY.

This email and any attachments are confidential, except where the email states it can be disclosed. It may also be privileged. If received in error, please do not disclose the contents to anyone, but notify the sender by return email and delete this email (and any attachments) from your system.